

Oversight Committee - Evaluation of the Audit RFP Responses

The Board office released the request for proposals for our annual Single Audit, as well as Federal and State Tax returns. We advertised in local newspapers twice, sent RFP packets to six CPA firms, listed as performing Single Audits by the Illinois CPA Society, and ten firms that had requested packets in previous years. We did receive three responses. With prices ranging from \$18,500 to 9,999, the evaluations came down to the estimated cost.

Our current Audit provider was the lowest bid at \$9,999. As I am sure you are aware, we have had issues with deadlines from this firm in the past few audits, but in a time when our funding is so uncertain, it is my recommendation that we remain with Walters. At \$18,500 from KEB (which did not include the actual Single Audit, it would be billed at a per-hour rate) and \$18,240 from Thomas & Company, I just do not feel that we can afford either of the other proposals.

My completed evaluations are included.

WATLER ACCOUNTING,CERTIFIED PUBLIC ACCOUNTANTS, P.C

Factors		Point Range	Score	Notes
Prior experience auditing and/or designing and installing accounting systems				
	Prior experience auditing programs funded by the Workforce Investment Act	0-5	5	Prior years firm
	Prior experience auditing similar programs funded by the State of Illinois	0-5	5	
	Prior experience auditing programs financed by the Federal Government	0-5	5	
	Prior experience auditing similar county or local government activities	0-5	5	
	Prior experience auditing nonprofit organizations	0-5	5	
	Prior experience designing and/or installing accounting systems in agencies using fund-based accounting programs	0-5	5	
Organization, size, and structure of Offerors firm. (Considering size in relation to audits to be performed.)				
	Adequate size of the firm	0-5	5	
	Minority/small business	0-5	0	Not specifically mentioned in response
Qualifications of staff to be assigned to the audits to be performed. This will be determined from resumes submitted. Education, position in firm, years and types of experience, continuing professional education, and state(s) in which licensed as a CPA, etc. will be considered.				
	Audit team makeup	0-10	10	
	Overall supervision to be exercised	0-5	5	
	Prior experience of the individual audit team members	0-10	10	
Offerors understanding of work to be performed.				
	Adequate coverage	0-5	5	
	Realistic time estimates of each audit step	0-10	10	
Price				Equal Prior Year Cost \$7,870 (20), 10% Over Prior Year (18), 20% Over Prior Year (15), 30% Over Prior Year (10), 40% Over Prior Year (5), 50% Over Prior Year (2), Greater Than 50% (1)
	Price of Response	0-20	15	Proposed Cost is \$9,990 - 21.2% increase
Total		0-100	90	



Watler Accounting

Certified Public Accountants, P.C.
www.watler.com

May 14, 2025

Ms. Pamela Barbee
Executive Director
Southern 14 Workforce Investment Board, Inc.
P.O. Box 186
Carmi, Illinois 62821

Dear Ms. Barbee:

We are committed to fair and reasonable pricing that maintains cost control on behalf of our clients while providing for the resources needed to maintain our strong and effective operations. We will attempt to minimize our fees without sacrificing the quality of our work. The extent to which this can be done will depend on the availability of your personnel to offer clerical assistance in preparing schedules and providing source documents. In any event, our proposed fee is based on an estimate of the time required to complete the assignment under normal circumstances.

We estimate that the fee for the audit will be \$9,990 for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2025. Information returns will be billed separately at our standard rates based on time spent. You will also be billed for travel and out-of-pocket costs such as report production, word processing, postage, etc. Additional expenses are estimated to be \$150. If this proposal is acceptable, the firm would agree to extend our offer for three years. Our annual audit fee will be billed in two installments; half will be billed upon completion of all field work with the final bill to be submitted upon delivery, acceptance, and approval of final reports. The fee estimate for the audit is based on the following hours and rates of the audit team:

Janet L. Storey, CPA	10 hrs. @ \$185	\$ 1,850
Audit Team	32 hrs. @ \$185	5,920
Audit Compliance and Review	12 hrs. @ \$185	<u>2,220</u>
Total		<u>\$ 9,990</u>

BRAZIL, IN
23 N Walnut St.
Brazil, IN 47834
Phone: (812) 446-8361
Fax: (812) 446-0842

BLOOMINGTON, IN
3908 S Walnut St.
Suite A
Bloomington, IN 47401
Phone: (812) 333-0600
Fax: (812) 332-9555

EVANSVILLE, IN
1401 E Louisiana St.
Evansville, IN 47711
Phone: (812) 425-5646
Phone: (812) 425-3003
Fax: (812) 425-5645

TERRE HAUTE, IN
1231 Maple Ave.
Terre Haute, IN 47804
Phone: (812) 232-4025
Fax: (812) 234-3899

MT. CARMEL, IL
528 N Market St.
Mt. Carmel, IL 62863
Phone: (618) 263-3567
Fax: (618) 262-8921
Fax: (618) 263-3569

Factors		Point Range	Score	Notes
Prior experience auditing and/or designing and installing accounting systems				
	Prior experience auditing programs funded by the Workforce Investment Act	0-5	0	Not specifically mentioned in response
	Prior experience auditing similar programs funded by the State of Illinois	0-5	0	Not specifically mentioned in response - No listed references in Illinois
	Prior experience auditing programs financed by the Federal Government	0-5	5	
	Prior experience auditing similar county or local government activities	0-5	5	
	Prior experience auditing nonprofit organizations	0-5	5	
	Prior experience designing and/or installing accounting systems in agencies using fund-based accounting programs	0-5	0	Not specifically mentioned in response
Organization, size, and structure of Offerors firm. (Considering size in relation to audits to be performed.)				
	Adequate size of the firm	0-5	5	
	Minority/small business	0-5	0	Not specifically mentioned in response
Qualifications of staff to be assigned to the audits to be performed. This will be determined from resumes submitted. Education, position in firm, years and types of experience, continuing professional education, and state(s) in which licensed as a CPA, etc. will be considered.				
	Audit team makeup	0-10	10	
	Overall supervision to be exercised	0-5	5	
	Prior experience of the individual audit team members	0-10	10	
Offerors understanding of work to be performed.				
	Adequate coverage	0-5	5	
	Realistic time estimates of each audit step	0-10	10	
Price				Equal Prior Year Cost \$7,870 (20), 10% Over Prior Year (18), 20% Over Prior Year (15), 30% Over Prior Year (10), 40% Over Prior Year (5), 50% Over Prior Year (2), Greater Than 50% (1)
	Price of Response	0-20	1	Proposed Cost is \$18,240 - 56.8% increase
Total		0-100	61	



Thomas & Company, CPA, PA
Certified Public Accountants and Business Consultants

Ms. Pamels Barbee,
Executive Director
Southern 14 Workforce Investment Board, Inc.
304 East Robinson, Suite 210,
Carmi, IL 62821

April 9, 2025

Ms. Pamels Barbee,

We are happy to present our qualifications to provide professional services for the independent audit of the financial statements of Southern 14 Workforce Investment Board, Inc. for the year ending June 30, 2025, in accordance with government auditing standards generally accepted in United States of America.

Our firm is a Certified Public Accounting firm, licensed by the Board of Accountancy in the State of Florida, with an expert staff of highly qualified and seasoned financial professionals having several years of experience in the audit of entities like Southern 14 Workforce Investment Board, Inc. All partners of the firm are Certified Public Accountants with many years of experience in the audit of non-profit organizations.

It is our understanding that the objective of the audit is to provide an opinion on the financial statements taken as a whole. We understand that the audit is to be conducted in accordance with auditing standards generally accepted in the United States. We have considered due dates for this engagement and anticipate that we will comply, subject to your approval.

Our professional fees for the services described will be based upon the standard hourly billing rates of individuals assigned to your organization's audit. This proposal is based on the assumption that your staff will provide us with the necessary documentation and information to perform our services. We estimate that our fees will be **\$ 18,240 for 2025** which includes the Single Audit in accordance with Uniform Guidance, and Form 990. This fee was based on the information provided by you and off the Audit Report received but can be negotiated and will adjust accordingly.

If you have any questions about our proposed services, please call me at (305)-747-3788.
Thank you in advance for the consideration of our proposal.

Very Truly,
Tony Thomas CPA
For Thomas & Company, CPA PA

9710 Stirling Rd, Suite # 101 -102 Cooper City, Florida 33024
Telephone (954) 435 7272, (954) 435 4488 Fax (954) 435 5558 Email – Info@jtccpa.com
Member: AICPA & FICPA - WWW.JTCCPA.COM

Factors		Point Range	Score	Notes
Prior experience auditing and/or designing and installing accounting systems				
	Prior experience auditing programs funded by the Workforce Investment Act	0-5	0	Not specifically mentioned in response
	Prior experience auditing similar programs funded by the State of Illinois	0-5	5	Mentioned performing Single Audits required by the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) Uniform Guidance and maintains voluntary membership in the AICPA Government Audit Quality Center.
	Prior experience auditing programs financed by the Federal Government	0-5	5	
	Prior experience auditing similar county or local government activities	0-5		Not specifically mentioned in response
	Prior experience auditing nonprofit organizations	0-5	5	
	Prior experience designing and/or installing accounting systems in agencies using fund-based accounting programs	0-5	0	Not specifically mentioned in response
Organization, size, and structure of Offerors firm. (Considering size in relation to audits to be performed.)				
	Adequate size of the firm	0-5	5	
	Minority/small business	0-5	0	Not specifically mentioned in response
Qualifications of staff to be assigned to the audits to be performed. This will be determined from resumes submitted. Education, position in firm, years and types of experience, continuing professional education, and state(s) in which licensed as a CPA, etc. will be considered.				
	Audit team makeup	0-10	10	
	Overall supervision to be exercised	0-5	5	
	Prior experience of the individual audit team members	0-10	10	
Offerors understanding of work to be performed.				
	Adequate coverage	0-5	5	
	Realistic time estimates of each audit step	0-10	10	
Price				Equal Prior Year Cost \$7,870 (20), 10% Over Prior Year (18), 20% Over Prior Year (15), 30% Over Prior Year (10), 40% Over Prior Year (5), 50% Over Prior Year (2), Greater Than 50% (1)
	Price of Response	0-20	1	Proposed Cost is \$18,500 - 57.4% increase - Not including Single Audit, which could be billed separately on a per-hour basis.
	Total	0-100	61	



PROPOSED FEES

We base our fees on a **blending of the billing** rates of the various levels of professionals we anticipate being involved with your work. We believe our fee estimates are conservative and represent the maximum time needed. Because the programs involved with a Single Audit can change from year to year, and the type of program impacts the amount of time needed to complete the Single Audit, that fee is a per hour fee.

Our estimated fees for a yearly financial audit, single audit, and annual 990 preparation are listed below.

Year Ending	Financial Statement Audit	Single Audit	Form 990	Form IL AG990	Total
June 30, 2025	\$15,000	\$200/hour	\$2,500	\$500	\$18,000 (without Single Audit)

Invoices will be rendered monthly as work progresses. Our invoices are due upon receipt. Fees for services performed are not expected to increase more than 5% annually.

We are often asked to provide special services not related to normal auditing or tax procedures or routine questions throughout the year. Specific matters resulting in additional charges will be discussed with you prior to performance of the procedures. The actual rate for special work depends upon the expertise and experience level of the professional staff required. Again, we will discuss fee issues in advance of performing procedures.

This investment includes all phone and in-person meetings, as well as ongoing communications within the scope of the current engagement. We are sensitive to out-of-pocket costs and how quickly they can add up to be a significant cost for Southern 14 Workforce Investment Board, Inc.. These billing rates are comprehensive and include all overhead, material and related costs.

Our current billing rates by level are listed below for your reference.

Partner	\$250/hour
Staff	\$90-180/hour

We recognize that circumstances may change which may cause either of us to annually reassess continuation of our relationship. While our proposal is for a one-year period, continuation of our relationship will be based on mutual agreement and execution of an annual letter of understanding (engagement letter).